

THE CORNELL LAW SCHOOL

MYRON TAYLOR HALL

Officers of Administration

Eduardo M. Peñalver, B.A., M.A., J.D., Allan R. Tessler Dean and Professor of Law
Jens David Ohlin, B.A., M.A., M.Phil., Ph.D., Vice Dean and Professor of Law
Femi Cadmus, LL.B., B.L., LL.M., M.L.I.S., Edward Cornell Law Librarian, Associate Dean for Library Services, and Professor of the Practice
John R. DeRosa, B.S., J.D., Associate Dean for Career Services & Employer Relations
Martha P. Fitzgerald, B.A., Associate Dean for Communications
Shawn Gavin, B.S., M.B.A., Associate Dean, Alumni Affairs and Development
Monica K. Ingram, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean of Admissions and Financial Aid
Ofer Leshed, B.A., M.B.A., Associate Dean for Administration & Finance
Markeisha J. Miner, B.A., J.D., Dean of Students
Richard F. Robinson, B.S., M.B.A., M.P.H., Associate Dean for Capital Projects
Laura M. Spitz, B.A., LL.B., J.S.D., Vice Provost, Associate Dean for International Affairs, and Senior Lecturer of Law
W. Bradley Wendel, B.A., J.D., LL.M., J.S.D., Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law
Akua Akyea, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Public Service
Elizabeth Brundige, B.A., M.Phil., J.D., Assistant Dean for International Programs, Associate Clinical Professor of Law, and Jack G. Clarke Executive Director of International and Comparative Legal Studies
Aimée Houghton, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Graduate Legal Studies
Elizabeth K. Peck, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Professional Development and Clerkships

Faculty

Gregory S. Alexander, B.A., J.D., A. Robert Noll Professor of Law
Joel Atlas, B.A., J.D., Director, Lawyering Program and Clinical Professor of Law
Sandra L. Babcock, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law
Marion J. Bachrach, B.A., M.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)
John J. Barceló III, B.A., J.D., S.J.D., William Nelson Cromwell Professor of International and Comparative Law
Andrew Berger, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)
Nathalia A. Bernardo, B.E.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)
Celia W. Bigoness, A.B., J.D., Assistant Clinical Professor of Law (Lawyering Program)
Franci J. Blassberg, A.B., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)
John H. Blume, B.A., M.A.R., J.D., Samuel F. Leibowitz Professor of Trial Techniques, Director of Clinical, Advocacy and Skills Program, and Director, Cornell Death Penalty Project
Cynthia Grant Bowman, B.A., Ph.D., J.D., Dorothea S. Clarke Professor of Law
Thomas R. Bruce, B.A., M.F.A., Research Associate and Director, Legal Information Institute
Elizabeth Brundige, B.A., M. Phil., J.D., Assistant Dean for International Programs, Associate Clinical Professor of Law, and Jack G. Clarke Executive Director of International and Comparative Legal Studies
Bruce R. Bryan, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)
Femi Cadmus, LL.B., B.L., LL.M., M.L.I.S., Edward Cornell Law Librarian, Associate Dean for Library Services, and Professor of the Practice
Joseph Callery, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (2017–2018)
Edward D. Cavanagh, A.B., J.D., LL.M., J.S.D., Visiting Professor of Law (2017–2018)
Josh Chafetz, B.A., D.Phil., J.D., Professor of Law
Dawn Chutkow, A.B., J.D., Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law
Kevin M. Clermont, A.B., J.D., Robert D. Ziff Professor of Law
Zachary D. Clopton, B.A., M.Phil., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law
Sherry F. Colb, A.B., J.D., Professor of Law and Charles Evans Hughes Scholar
Angela B. Cornell, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law and Director, Labor Law Clinic
Sally Fisher Curran, B.A., J.D. Adjunct Professor of Law (2017–2018)
Matthew D'Amore, B.S., J.D., Professor of the Practice, Cornell Tech
James W. Dabney, A.B., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)
Hanoel Dagan, LL.M., J.S.D., LL.B., Visiting Professor of Law (Fall 2017)
Samuel D. Dahan, Ph.D., LL.M., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)
Michael C. Dorf, B.A., J.D., Robert S. Stevens Professor of Law
Henry D. Edelman, B.A., M.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)
Amy A. Emerson, J.D., M.L.S., Director, Legal Research Clinic, Adjunct Professor of Law
Susan E. Emmenegger, J.D., LL.M., Ph.D., Dr. Habil., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)
Cynthia R. Farina, B.A., J.D., William G. McRoberts Research Professor in Administration of the Law
Jonathan W. Feldman, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)
Catherine H. Finn, B.A., J.D., Lecturer of Law
Michelle A. Fongvee Whelan, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law (Lawyering Program)
Charles Fox, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor (Spring 2018)
Lara Gelbwasser Freed, B.S., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law (Lawyering Program)
Jim Fulton, B.S., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)
Maggie Gardner, A.B., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law
Stephen P. Garvey, B.A., M.Phil., J.D., Professor of Law
Neil Getnick, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)
Sujata Gibson, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)
Sergio Alberto Gramitto Ricci, J.D., Ph.D., Adjunct Professor of Law, Postdoctoral Associate, and Assistant Director, Clarke Program on Corporations & Society
Robert A. Green, B.A., M.S., J.D., Professor of Law
James Grimmelmann, A.B., J.D., Professor of Law, Cornell Tech
Louis H. Guard, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)
Valerie P. Hans, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Professor of Law
George A. Hay, B.S., M.A., Ph.D., Charles Frank Reavis Sr. Professor of Law and Professor of Economics
Thomas J. Heiden, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (January 2018 Intersession)
Michael Heise, A.B., J.D., Ph.D., Professor of Law
Robert A. Hillman, A.B., J.D., Edwin H. Woodruff Professor of Law
Robert C. Hockett, B.A., M.A., J.D., LL.M., J.S.D., Edward Cornell Professor of Law
Barbara J. Holden-Smith, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law
Arnold S. Jacobs, B.M.E., M.B.A., LL.B., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)
William A. Jacobson, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law and Director, Securities Law Clinic
Richard John, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (2017–2018)

Sheri Lynn Johnson, B.A., J.D., James and Mark Flanagan Professor of Law and Assistant Director, Cornell Death Penalty Project

James J. Junewicz, B.S.F.S., M.B.A., J.D., LL.M., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

Sital Kalantry, A.B., M.Sc., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law

John Kallaugher, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)

Jaclyn Kelley-Widmer, B.A., J.D., Assistant Clinical Professor of Law (Lawyering Program)

Takayuki Kihira, LL.M., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)

Susan C. Knight, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)

Gregory Krakower, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)

Sarah Kreps, B.A., M.Sc., Ph.D., Associate Professor of Government and Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

Douglas Lasdon, B.S., J.D., Distinguished Practitioner in Residence (Fall 2017)

Mitchel D. Lasser, B.A., J.D., M.A., Ph.D., Jack G. Clarke Professor of Law and Director, Graduate Studies

Shay Lavie, LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

Howard Leib, B.S., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

Stephane Levy, B.C., B.C.L., LL.B., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

Odette Lienau, A.B., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., Professor of Law

Oskar Liivak, B.S., Ph.D., J.D., Professor of Law

David B. Lipsky, B.S., Ph.D., Anne Evans Estabrook Professor of Dispute Resolution, Stephen H. Weiss Presidential Fellow, and Adjunct Professor of Law (2017–2018)

Beth Lyon, B.A., M.S., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law

Joseph Margulies, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law and Government

Andrei Marmor, B.A., LL.B., M.A., D.Phil., Jacob Gould Schurman Professor of Philosophy and Law

Edward McArdle, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (2017–2018)

Paul A. McCulley, M.B.A., B.S., Senior Fellow in Financial Macroeconomics and Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

Bryan A. McGrane, A.B., J.D., LL.M., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)

Estelle M. McKee, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law (Lawyering Program)

Ryan D. McNaughton, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)

Kelly Mellecker, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)

Andrea J. Mooney, B.A., M.Ed., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law

Muna B. Ndulo, LL.B., LL.M., D.Phil., Professor of Law, Elizabeth and Arthur Reich Director, Leo and Arvilla Berger International Legal Studies Program and Director, Institute for African Development

Gregory J. Nowak, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)

Maureen O'Hara, B.S., M.A., Ph.D., Robert W. Purcell Professorship of Management (JGSM) and Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

Jens David Ohlin, B.A., M.A., M.Phil., Ph.D., J.D., Vice Dean and Professor of Law

Saule T. Omarova, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., Professor of Law

Martin W. O'Toole, A.B., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)

Eduardo M. Penalver, B.A., M.A., J.D., Allan R. Tessler Dean and Professor of Law

Michael D. Pinnisi, A.B., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)

Carrie Pollak, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

David S. Powers, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Professor of Arabic and Islamic Studies and Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)

Jeffrey J. Rachlinski, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., Henry Allen Mark Professor of Law

Dana M. Radcliffe, B.A., M.Phil., M.B.A., Ph.D., Day Family Senior Lecturer in Business Ethics, Senior Lecturer of Management, Johnson Graduate School of Management, and Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)

Neil N. Radey, M.B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)

Anthony M. Radice, A.B., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

Aziz F. Rana, A.B., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., Professor of Law

Patricia A. Ranieri, B.A., J.D., M.B.A., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

Annelise Riles, A.B., M.Sc., J.D., Ph.D., Jack G. Clarke Professor of Far East Legal Studies, Professor of Anthropology

Charles E. Roberts, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (2017–2018)

Menachem Z. Rosensaft, B.A., M.A., M.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

David A. Sakowitz, A.B., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2017)

Lance Salisbury, B.S., M.A., M.R.P., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

John L. Sander, A.B., A.M., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2018)

Robert A. Sarachan, B.A., B.S., M.B.A., J.D., M.S., Adjunct Professor of Law (2017–2018)

Rocco M. Scanza, B.A., J.D., Executive Director, Martin and Laurie Scheinman Institute on Conflict Resolution, School of Industrial and Labor Relations and Adjunct Professor of Law (2017–2018)

Stewart J. Schwab, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., Jonathan and Ruby Zhu Professor of Law

Anthony Sebok, B.A., M.Phil., J.D., Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law (Spring 2018)

Jeffrey C. Shepardson, B.A., M.A., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

Emily L. Sherwin, B.A., J.D., Frank B. Ingersoll Professor of Law

Birgitta K. Siegel, B.S., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (2017–2018)

Jonathan D. Siegfried, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

John A. Siliciano, B.A., M.P.A., J.D., Deputy Provost and Professor of Law

Jed Stiglitz, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law and Jia Jonathan Zhu and Ruyin Ruby Ye Sesquicentennial Fellow

Lynn A. Stout, B.A., M.P.A., J.D., Distinguished Professor of Corporate and Business Law

Nelson Tebbe, A.B., J.D., Ph.D., Professor of Law

Chantal Thomas, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law and Director, Clarke Initiative for Law and Development in the Middle East and North Africa

Gerald Torres, A.B., LL.M., J.D., Jane M.G. Foster Professor of Law

Laura Underkuffler, B.A., J.D., LL.M., J.S.D., J. DuPratt White Professor of Law

W. Bradley Wendel, B.A., J.D., LL.M., J.S.D., Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law

Robert J. Wertheimer, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

Richard C. Wesley, B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of the Practice (Fall 2017)

Chenay B. Weyble, B.A., J.D., Lecturer of Law and Director of Academic Support

Keir M. Weyble, B.S., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law and Director of Death Penalty Litigation

Charles K. Whitehead, B.A., J.D., Myron C. Taylor Alumni Professor of Business Law and Director, Law, Technology and Entrepreneurship Program

Jeffrey J. Whitehead, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

Christopher Wiles, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (2017–2018)

Stephen W. Yale-Loehr, B.A., J.D., Professor of Immigration Law Practice

Xingzhong Yu, B.A., LL.M., S.J.D., Anthony W. and Lulu C. Wang Professor in Chinese Law

Stephen G. Yusem, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

Urs Zulauf, Dr. iur., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2017)

Faculty Emeriti

Claire M. Germain, Licence-ès-Lettres, LL.B., M.C.L. M.L.L., Edward Cornell Law Librarian (retired) and Professor of Law, Emerita
Jane L. Hammond, B.A., M.S., J.D., Edward Cornell Law Librarian (retired) and Professor of Law, Emerita
James A. Henderson, Jr., A.B., LL.B., LL.M., Frank B. Ingersoll Professor of Law, Emeritus
David B. Lyons, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Professor of Law, Emeritus and Susan Linn Sage Professor of Philosophy, Emeritus
Peter W. Martin, B.A., J.D., Jane M.G. Foster Professor of Law, Emeritus
Larry I. Palmer, B.A., LL.B., Professor of Law, Emeritus
E.F. Roberts, Jr., B.A., LL.B., Edwin H. Woodruff Professor of Law, Emeritus
Faust F. Rossi, B.A., J.D., Samuel S. Leibowitz Professor of Trial Techniques, Emeritus
Steven H. Shiffrin, B.A., M.A., J.D., Charles Frank Reavis Sr. Professor of Law, Emeritus
Gary J. Simson, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law, Emeritus
Katherine Van Wezel Stone, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law, Emerita and Anne Evans Estabrook Professor in Dispute Resolution, Emerita
Robert S. Summers, B.S., LL.B., LL.D., William G. McRoberts Professor of Research in the Administration of the Law, Emeritus
Winnie F. Taylor, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law, Emerita
Charles W. Wolfram, B.A., LL.B., Charles Frank Reavis Sr. Professor of Law, Emeritus

Associate and Elected Members from Other Faculties

Ifeoma Ajunwa, B.A., J.D., M.Phil., Ph.D., Associate Member of the Law Faculty & Assistant Professor, School of Industrial & Labor Relations
Elizabeth S. Anker, B.A., J.D., Ph.D., Associate Professor English and Associate Member of the Law Faculty
Karen Levy, B.A., J.D., M.A., Ph.D., Associate Member of the Law Faculty and Assistant Professor, Department of Information Science
Helen Nissenbaum, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Associate Member of the Law Faculty and Professor, Cornell Tech
Sid Tarrow, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Associate Member of the Law Faculty & Maxwell M. Upson Professor Emeritus, Government Department
Martin T. Wells, B.S., M.A., Ph.D., Charles A. Alexander Professor of Social Statistics, NYS School of Industrial and Labor Relations and Elected Member of the Law Faculty

CORNELL LAW REVIEW

Volume 103

November 2017

Number 1

Editor-in-Chief

SCOTT B. COHEN

Managing Editor

PETER M. KAHNERT

Executive Editors

JULIA L. BENSUR

JOHN F. READY

EUGENE TEMCHENKO

Senior Articles Editor

JENNA MICHELLE SCOVILLE

Senior Online Editor

MICAH BROWN

Senior Notes Editor

SHIRA A. STEINBERG

Articles Editors

BRANDON C. BIAS

GAVIN M. BOSCH

JAMES V. CABALLERO

KARA L. GOAD

DENIS R. HURLEY

HOO RI KIM

STEPHEN LAGOS

JAIME LEE

ANNA MARIENKO

CHRISTOPHER M. PLANTE

EMILY M. RECTOR

PATRICK P. SANDMAN

KEVIN P. WESTERMAN

KATHLEEN E. YOUNG

Publishing Editors

JORDAN C. BENSON

GRANT AMADEUS GIEL

NICHOLAS D. HALLIBURTON

MICHAEL S. SANTOPIETRO

ELIZABETH M. SULLIVAN

Online Editors

SETH D. CROCKETT

CLAIRE E. HALLELAND

TREVOR R. MARTIN

SAMANTHA G. ROSE

SHELBI A. VAUGHN

RYAN T. WARD

Notes Editors

GARGI CHAUDHURI

WEIRU FANG

JENNY Z. HU

ANGELICA H. NGUYEN

KIMBERLY K. PETRICK

JESSE W. SHERMAN

Projects Editor

TREVOR R. MARTIN

Alumni Relations Editor

CLAIRE E. HALLELAND

Editors

RACHEL M. BACHTEL

CHARLOTTE M. HOPKINSON

EMILY D. LE

MARIAH N. RIVERA

J. XANDER SAIDE

Associates

BEATRIZ L. ALBORNOZ

KRISTIN ALVARADO

THOMAS D.M. BELCASTRO

LARRY M. BLOCHO JR.

ALEX R. BRANSFORD

PABLO CHAPA BLANCO

AVERY A. CUMMINGS

ELIZABETH H. DENNING

JON DERENNE

JOSHUA S. DULBERG

GARRETT W. GERBER

ROBIN GRIEFF

ANDREW T. GUIANG

JARED HAM

ALYSON R. HAMBY

ALYSSA M. HASBROUCK

ROBERT H. HENDRICKS

JONATHAN N. HERNANDEZ

MADELAINE J. HORN

JED S. HUDSON

KRISTINA M. HURLEY

MICHAEL C. IADEVAIA

STEPHANIE R. JURKOWSKI

RAHUL KRISHNAN

ANGELINE M. LARRIVEE

JOON LEE

BRADLEY T. LENOX

PAUL D. LOWRY

BRYAN P. MAGEE

LEONARDO MANGAT

HALEY P. MARTIN

MORGAN A. MILLER

NICHOLAUS C. MILLS

GREGORY J. MINA

CONNOR F. O'NEILL

CHRISTOPHER W. PANTUSO

NEETHU S. PUTTA

CONNIE QIAN

LAUREN A. KASSOUF QUAN

KARA A. RAMSEY

MARISSA B.M. RIVERA

PETER F. ROSANIA

MATTHEW C. ROWE

CHARLES M. SIM

BARIS SIMSEK

HENRY R. TOPPER

DOUGLAS E. WAGNER

CULLINAN G. WILLIAMS

AMANDA J. WONG

CONLEY WOUTERS

YIXIN YAN

Faculty Advisor

JOSH CHAFETZ

Administrative Assistant

SUSAN G. PADO

Antidiscrimination Statement

It is the policy of the *Cornell Law Review* to support equality of opportunity. No person shall be denied membership in the *Cornell Law Review* or participation in any of its activities, including publication, on the basis of any legally prohibited discrimination involving, but not limited to, such factors including race, color, creed, religion, national or ethnic origin, sex, sexual orientation, age, or disability. To improve the overall quality of its publication, the *Cornell Law Review* hopes to expand its membership to include persons from traditionally underrepresented groups, as well as persons with diverse viewpoints. Sexual harassment is an act of discrimination and, as such, will not be tolerated.

Permission

The *Cornell Law Review* hereby grants permission to nonprofit organizations to reproduce and distribute the contents of this journal, in whole or in part, for educational purposes, including distribution to students, provided that the copies are distributed at or below cost and identify the author, the *Cornell Law Review*, the volume, the number of the first page of the article, and the year of publication.

All other inquiries for permission should be sent to the attention of the Editor-in-Chief.

Publication Information

This journal is published six times annually, in November, January, March, May, July, and September at Lincoln, Nebraska, by the *Cornell Law Review* (ISSN 0010-8847). Periodicals postage is paid at Ithaca, New York, and additional mailing offices. Office of Publication: Cornell Law School, 127 Myron Taylor Hall, Ithaca, New York 14853. Printing Office: Joe Christensen, Inc., 1540 Adams Street, Lincoln, Nebraska 68521. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to the *Cornell Law Review*, Cornell Law School, 127 Myron Taylor Hall, Ithaca, New York 14853.

Subscription Information

Annual subscriptions are \$45.00. Single issues are \$15.00 for issues in the current volume. Foreign subscribers should add \$4.00 for postage fees. The Cornell Alumni Association members who wish to receive a subscription to the *Cornell Law Review* need to contact the *Law Review* office directly to arrange the subscription. Your subscription will be automatically renewed unless notification to the contrary is received by the *Cornell Law Review*.

Please notify the *Cornell Law Review* of any change of address at least 30 days before the date of the issue from which the change is to take effect. The postal service will not forward your copies unless extra postage is provided by you. Duplicate copies will not be sent free of charge.

Subscribers should report nonreceipt of copies within six months of the expected mailing date. Issues in Volumes 1 through 102 are available through: William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 2350 North Forest Road, Getzville, New York 14068-1296 (<http://www.wshein.com/>).

Please address correspondence to:

Cornell Law Review
Myron Taylor Hall
Ithaca, NY 14853-4901

Fax (607) 255-7193
Business Office (607) 255-3387
E-mail sgp6@cornell.edu